Designing Case Studies

Explanatory Approaches in Small-N Research

Joachim Blatter

Professor of Political Science, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, University of Lucerne, Switzerland

and

Markus Haverland

Professor of Political Science, Department of Public Administration, Erasumus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands



Contents

Lisi	t of Fig	gures and	l Tables	xiii
Lisi	t of Ab	breviatio	ons	xv
Pre	face to	the Pape	erback Edition	xvi
Pre	face ar	ıd Ackno	owledgements	xviii
1	Rele	evance a	and Refinements of Case Studies	1
	1.1 Case studies as cornerstones for theories and		tudies as cornerstones for theories and	
		researc	ch programs	2
	1.2	The ca	se for case study research	5
		1.2.1	The growing relevance of timing, cognition, and interdependence	5
		1.2.2	Perforated boundaries in social reality and the social sciences	6
		1.2.3	Building bridges between paradigmatic camps	7
	1.3	The ca	se for a non-fundamentalist and pluralist	
		epister	mology	9
		1.3.1	Empiricism/Positivism and Critical	
			Rationalism	9
		1.3.2		1.0
		1 2 2	Critical Theory	10
		1.3.3 1.3.4		12
		1.5.4	Anti-fundamentalist and pluralistic	13
	1.4	Case s	tudy methodology: A brief history and recent	13
			butions	15
	1.5	Case s	tudies: Towards a generic and	
		multic	dimensional definition	18
	1.6	Obser	vations: Towards an adequate understanding	
		for cas	se studies	20
	1.7	Three	approaches to case study research:	
		An ove	erview	23
		171	Research goals and questions	2.3

		1.7.2	Case and theory selection	24
		1.7.3	Data generation and data analysis	28
		1.7.4	Generalization	30
2	Co-Variational Analysis			33
	2.1		ch goals and research questions	35
	2.2	ogical and epistemological foundations and		
		affiniti	ies	36
		2.2.1	Experimental template and counterfactual	
			concept of causation	37
		2.2.2	Experimental control versus control in	
			observational studies	38
		2.2.3	Probabilistic versus deterministic causality	38
		2.2.4	Autonomous versus configurational	
			causality	41
	2.3	Selecti	ing cases	41
		2.3.1	Criteria for case selection	42
		2.3.2	Modes of comparison	44
		2.3.3	Cross-sectional comparison	45
		2.3.4	Intertemporal comparison	46
		2.3.5	Cross-sectional-intertemporal comparison	47
		2.3.6	Counterfactual comparison	48
		2.3.7	Excursus: The method of agreement and the	
			most different systems design	, 49
	2.4	2.4 The functions of prior knowledge and theory		50
		2.4.1	Specifying the main independent and the	
			dependent variable	51
		2.4.2	Substantiating the research hypothesis	52
		2.4.3	Identifying control variables	54
	2.5	Drawi	ng causal inferences for the cases under	
		invest	igation	54
		2.5.1	Data set results and conclusions	55
		2.5.2	Examples	58
		2.5.3	Concluding remarks	61
	2.6		urement and data collection	63
		2.6.1	Conceptualization and measurement in	
			large-N versus small-N research	63
		2.6.2	Determination of classifications and cut-off	
			points	65
		2.6.3	Replicability and measurement error	67
		2.6.4	Data triangulation	68

2.7	Direct	ion of generalization	68
2.8	Preser	nting findings and conclusions	70
2.9	Example of best practice: Zangl's fudicalization		
	Matter	s!	71
2.10	Summ	ary and conclusions	75
2.11		ndix: How to make counterfactual analysis	
		compelling	76
Caus	al-Proc	eess Tracing	79
3.1		rch goals and research questions	84
	3.1.1	Starting points and research goals	84
	3.1.2	Research goals and functions of	
		causal-process tracing	87
	3.1.3	Research questions	88
3.2		ogical and epistemological foundations	90
	3.2.1	Contingency	91
	3.2.2	Causal conditions and configurations	92
	3.2.3	Additive and interactive configurations	93
	3.2.4	Causal conjunctions and causal chains	94
	3.2.5	Social and causal mechanisms	95
	3.2.6	Summary	97
	3.2.7	Appendix: Contexts	98
3.3	Select	ing cases	99
	3.3.1	Misleading advice and trade-offs	99
	3.3.2	General criteria for selecting cases	102
	3.3.3	Specific criteria for selecting cases according	
		to different research goals	102
3.4	Collec	eting empirical information	105
3.5		ng causal inferences for the case(s) under	
		igation	106
	3.5.1	The added value of causal-process	
		observations	107
	3.5.2	Major features of causal-process tracing	109
	3.5.3	Empirical fundaments of CPT: Storylines,	
		smoking guns, and confessions	110
	3.5.4	Logical foundations of CPT I: Causal chains	119
	3.5.5	Logical foundations of CPT II: Process	
		dynamics	121
3.6	Exam	-	123
	3.6.1	Brady's Data-Set Observations versus	
		Causal-Process Observations	124

3

Contents ix

Contents

	3.6.2	Skocpol's States and Social Revolutions	127
	3.6.3	Tannenwald's The Nuclear Taboo	130
3.7	Direct	tion of generalization	134
	3.7.1	Implicit and explicit generalizations	135
	3.7.2	'Possibilistic' generalization	135
	3.7.3	Drawing conclusions to the sets of	
		causal conditions and	
		configurations	137
	3.7.4	Drawing conclusions to the sets of social	
		and causal mechanisms	139
3.8	Preser	nting findings and conclusions	141
3.9	Summ	nary	142
Con	gruence	e Analysis	144
4.1	Resear	rch goals and research questions	148
	4.1.1	Research goals	149
	4.1.2	Research questions	150
4.2	Ontological and epistemological foundations and		
	affinit	ies	152
	4.2.1	Illustrating the epistemological foundation	
		of the CON approach	152
	4.2.2	F	154
	4.2.3	r	
		approach	160
4.3		ing theories and cases	167
	4.3.1	Selection and specification of	
		theories	169
		· Selection and specification of cases	175
	4.3.3	Crucial cases	176
4.4	Form	ulating expectations and collecting data	178
	4.4.1	The specification of propositions	179
	4.4.2		185
	4.4.3	The collection of information and	
		production of data	187
4.5		analysis – The congruence analysis proper	188
	4.5.1	The steps of the congruence analysis	
		proper	189
	4.5.2	The full set of possible conclusions	189
	4.5.3	Examples: Applications of the congruence	
		analysis proper	191

4.6	Direct	ion of generalization	197
	4.6.1	Theoretical generalization within a	
		competing theories approach	198
	4.6.2	Theoretical generalization within a	
		complementary theories approach	200
4.7	Preser	nting findings and conclusions	202
4.8	Summ	nary	203
Con	nbining	Diverse Research Approaches	205
5.1	_	oining approaches and designs: Purposes and	
	possib		207
	5.1.1	Strengthening concept validity of	
		descriptive inference	208
	5.1.2	Strengthening or testing the internal	
		validity of causal inference	210
	5.1.3	Complementing the range of variables,	
		conditions, mechanisms, and theories	211
	5.1.4	Increasing the external validity of causal	
		inferences	211
5.2	Comb	pining co-variational analysis and	
		-process tracing	212
	5.2.1	X-centered combination of COV	
		and CPT	212
	5.2.2	Y-centered combination of cross-case	
		comparisons and CPT	216
5.3	Combining congruence analysis and causal-process		210
	tracing		218
	5.3.1	Causal-process tracing as part of a	-10
	0.5.1	congruence analysis	218
	5.3.2	Causal-process tracing as an inductive	210
	3.3.2	addition to the deductive congruence	
		analysis	219
5.4	Connecting case, studies to large-N studies		
J. I	5.4.1	Case studies augmenting large-N studies	224 224
	5.4.2	Case studies preceding large-N studies	229
5.5		ecting case studies to medium-N studies	231
د.ر	5.5.1	Qualitative Comparative Analysis as a	231
	5.5.1	follow-up to case studies	232
	5.5.2	Case studies as a follow-up to a Qualitative	232
	5.5.4	Comparative Analysis	234
		Comparative Analysis	<i>23</i> 4

xii Contents

5.6	Preconditions for combining different explanatory		
	approaches	236	
5.7	Final remarks	237	
Notes		239	
Bibliography		246	
Index			