Contents

Series editors' preface page xi
Preface xiii

CHAPTER 1
REFLECTIONS ON THE COMMONS 1

Three influential models 2
   The tragedy of the commons 2
   The prisoner's dilemma game 3
   The logic of collective action 5
The metaphorical use of models 7
Current policy prescriptions 8
   Leviathan as the "only" way 8
   Privatization as the "only" way 12
   The "only" way? 13
An alternative solution 15
An empirical alternative 18
Policy prescriptions as metaphors 21
Policies based on metaphors can be harmful 23
A challenge 23

CHAPTER 2
AN INSTITUTIONAL APPROACH TO THE STUDY OF
SELF-ORGANIZATION AND SELF-GOVERNANCE IN CPR
SITUATIONS 29

The CPR situation 30
CPRs and resource units 30
Rational appropriators in complex and uncertain situations 33
Contents

Interdependence, independent action, and collective action 38
  The theory of the firm 40
  The theory of the state * 41
Three puzzles: supply, commitment, and monitoring * 42
  The problem of supply 42
  The problem of credible commitment 43
  The problem of mutual monitoring 45
Framing inquiry 45
  Appropriation and provision problems 46
  Multiple levels of analysis 50
  Studying institutions in field settings 55

CHAPTER 3
ANALYZING LONG-ENDURING, SELF-ORGANIZED, AND SELF-GOVERNED CPRs 58

Communal tenure in high mountain meadows and forests 61
  Torbel, Switzerland 61
  Hirano, Nagaike, and Yamanoka villages in Japan 65
Huerta irrigation institutions 69
  Valencia 71
  Murcia and Orihuela 76
  Alicante 78
Zanjera irrigation communities in the Philippines 82
Similarities among enduring, self-governing CPR institutions 88
  Clearly defined boundaries 91
  Congruence between appropriation and provision rules and local conditions 92
  Collective-choice arrangements 93
  Monitoring 94
  Graduated sanctions 94
  Conflict-resolution mechanisms 100
  Minimal recognition of rights to organize 101
  Nested enterprises 101

CHAPTER 4
ANALYZING INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE 103

The competitive pumping race. 104
  The setting . 104
  The logic of the water-rights game 106
The litigation game 111
Contents

The Raymond Basin negotiations 111
The West Basin negotiations 114
The Central Basin litigation 123
Conformance of parties to negotiated settlements 125
The entrepreneurship game 127
Reasons for forming a district to include both basins 130
Reasons against forming a district to include both basins 131
The polycentric public-enterprise game 133
The analysis of institutional supply 136
Incremental, sequential, and self-transforming institutional change in a facilitative political regime 137
Reformulating the analysis of institutional change 139

CHAPTER 5
ANALYZING INSTITUTIONAL FAILURES AND FRAGILITIES 143

Two Turkish inshore fisheries with continuing CPR problems 144
California groundwater basins with continuing CPR problems 146
A Sri Lankan fishery 149
Irrigation development projects in Sri Lanka 157
The fragility of Nova Scotian inshore fisheries 173
Lessons to be learned from comparing the cases in this study 178

CHAPTER 6
A FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS OF SELF-ORGANIZING AND SELF-GOVERNING CPRs 182

The problems of supply, credible commitment, and mutual monitoring 185
A framework for analyzing institutional choice 192
Evaluating benefits 195
Evaluating costs 198
Evaluating shared norms and other opportunities 205
The process of institutional change 207
Predicting institutional change 210
A challenge to scholarship in the social sciences 214

Notes 217
References 245
Index 271